

SUMMARY OF ADMINISTRATIVE MEETING
February 4, 2015– 4:00 p.m.
Room 326, City-County Building

1. Call to order, introductions, opening comments – Mayor Smith called the meeting to order. Commissioners Ellison, Elsaesser, Haladay and Haque-Hausrath were present. Staff present was: City Manager Ron Alles; Executive Assistant Sarah Elkins; City Attorney Thomas Jodoin; Police Chief Troy McGee; Public Works Director Randall Camp; City Engineer Ryan Leland; Solid Waste Superintendent Pete Anderson; HATS Supervisor Steve Larson; HATS Administrative Assistant Barb Sheridan; Administrative Services Director Tim Magee; Human Resources Director James Fehr; Parks Superintendent Craig Marr, Community Facilities Director Gery Carpenter; Fire Chief Sean Logan; HCC Coordinator Judy Garrity and City Clerk Debbie Havens.

Others in attendance included: HCC Representative Dick Sloan; HTAC members Elizabeth Andrews, Brian Johnson, Debora Swingley, Jessica Peterson, Vivian Crabtree; Senator Daines' Field Representative Morgan Darlington; IR Reporter Al Knauber; MILP representatives Bob Maffitt and Les Clark; Jodie Bingham and Mike Wignot with Hydrometrics; Head Start Family Advocate Jaymie Sheldahl and Laura Erickson.

January 21, 2015 - The January 21, 2015 administrative meeting summary was approved as submitted.

2. Commission comments, questions –

Board Appointments – There are no board appointments on the February 9, 2015 city commission meeting agenda.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated she will be out of town the week of the proposed extra administrative meeting and would like to be present when recycling is on the agenda. The recycling collection RFP could move forward prior to the full discussion on recycling processing and solid waste. She also noted she has no additional direction for the Scope of Work for the Front Street and Helena Avenue projects. She would like to see a special meeting or have it at the top of an agenda to discuss the snow removal ordinance. There have been interested members of the public show up at the last two administrative meetings and there hasn't been time to discuss the ordinance.

City Clerk Havens reported there was a proposal to hold two additional administrative meetings the week of February 17th; however, two commissioners will be out of town. She will send a follow-up email to the commission to get some dates and report back.

Manager Alles commented he would like the discussions on solid waste and recycling be combined and be a separate meeting. He concurred the sidewalk snow removal ordinance could be combined with other agenda items; however, it would be the first item on the agenda.

Mayor Smith asked if there was commission consensus for the RFP for Front Street and Helena Avenue projects. There was commission concurrence to move forward with the two RFPs for Front Street and Helena Avenue projects.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath concurred the snow removal ordinance does not need to be a single agenda item meeting and noted she does not plan on submitting a large number of amendments.

Mayor Smith noted the Helena Citizens Council has submitted two recommendations; one on the snow removal ordinance and the other on the quiet zone. He recommended the commission take the last 10-15 minutes of the meeting to discuss the recommendations.

Mayor Smith introduced Morgan Darlington, Field Representative for Senator Daines. Ms. Darlington addressed the commission and gave her professional background and welcomed anyone to contact their office.

4. City Manager's Report

Legislative Update – City Manager Alles referred the commission to the list of introduced and un-introduced bills that deals with local government. He specifically noted the following bills: HB 224, HB 270, HB 364, HB 371, SB37, SB160, SB214 and SB226.

Commissioner Ellison mentioned a bill that has to do with the Board of Adjustment; which would allow the city commission/councils to be the next level of review for the Board of Adjustment prior to going to District Court. Attorney Jodoin noted the last time he reviewed this bill, it was for county Board of Adjustments and when he was asked if the city wanted to be a part, he recommended no.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked City Manager Alles to check in with the League on this bill.

Manager Alles asked the commission to review the list and let him know if there are bills they would like staff to pay closer attention to.

Manager Alles reported last week there were 1136 riders on the Capital Shuttle.

5. Department Discussions

Public Works

Landfill Monitoring District – Extraction Trench – City Manager Alles introduced the agenda item and noted city staff has been monitoring the methane levels for a long time. He wanted to go on record that there is no immediate risk for those persons using Centennial Park.

Manager Alles introduced Jodie Bingham and Mike Wignot with Hydrometrics, Inc. who gave a PowerPoint presentation that included information on the following:

- Groundwater Monitoring Program
- Groundwater Extraction System
- Methane Hazard
- Methane Monitoring at the Helena Landfill
- Helena Landfill – Methane Removal Systems
- Methane Levels within Landfill
- Methane Levels at Southern Boundary
- Utility Corridor and New Vapor Probes with 6-month Methane Averages
- Proposal Remedial Actions
 - Notify utility companies of methane hazard
 - Get one One-Call list for digs in the area
 - Passive methane interception trench
- Proposed Methane Interception Trench Details
- Costs include Design Costs of \$18,000; Proposed Methane Interception Trench of \$128,925 and annual operation and maintenance costs of \$3,000.

Commissioner Ellison asked what an explosive level of methane is. Ms. Bingham explained it is the methane level combined with oxygen and a spark, there is potential for an explosion. Commissioner Ellison asked what the difference is between an active system versus a passive system. Ms. Bingham explained an active system would have a mechanical blower and a passive system is more natural and has much less maintenance costs. The cost of an active blower is approximately \$20,000, Hydrometrics recommendation is to go with the passive system.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath asked what the one-call system would actually tell a contractor of the methane levels. Ms. Bingham noted the one-call system has instructions to contact public works, who would then make personal contact with any contractor wanting to dig in the area. This is the primary concern with anyone working in the utility trenches.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked if there is some point that these emissions would have to be monitored. Ms. Bingham stated if an active system is used, yes. Commissioner Elsaesser asked at what concentration level would require an active system. Ms. Bingham stated 20% concentration level would require an active system; at this point they are trying to create barriers so the methane does not expand.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked at what level does the trash from the old landfill begin. Ms. Bingham stated the trash starts at about one-foot down and goes down approximately 15-feet down. Commissioner Elsaesser asked is there any other liabilities aside from methane that have spiked in the last few years. Ms. Bingham stated groundwater is also monitored at the landfill. She explained the process that is used to collect the groundwater from the landfill site and ultimately used for irrigation water for the golf course.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked if there are any other property owners where the methane levels are high. Manager Alles noted the State of Montana owns the parking lot adjacent to the park and the easements along Euclid Avenue.

Manager Alles commented the cost to use the passage system makes sense; it can always be upgraded to the active system, if needed. The passive system is working adjacent to Carroll College and he would recommend moving forward with the project, either pre or post irrigation season. Manager Alles stated the landfill monitoring assessment was created for this very purpose. The commission could choose to pay cash for the project and increase the assessment to pay for it. However, Manager Alles recommended the city finance the project for five years and then approve smaller increases over the next five years. Staff is coordinating with DEQ on when to complete the project.

Manager Alles noted Commissioner Elsaesser had asked if the irrigation impacts the level of methane and the answer is it may to a very small extent. If you stop irrigating, the methane levels will go down. Before the landfill monitoring assessment was implemented, the cost for methane monitoring was split between residential and commercial solid waste.

Mayor Smith stated it will ultimately be the landfill monitoring district that will pay for this and the commission could incrementally increase the assessment over the next five years. Manager Alles stated yes.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated in order to avoid fearful calls, she reiterated there is no immediate danger to persons using Centennial Park and contractors will use one call system and work with city staff. Commissioner Ellison noted for the record that dogs are also safe.

Mayor Smith stated the message to call before you dig is very important. Ms. Bingham noted she has made personal contact with the utility contractors.

Mayor Smith asked if there are any other compliance issues that need to be addressed. Ms. Bingham noted the groundwater compliance wells are not in compliance; so far DEQ is not making a big deal out of it and city staff is aware of it. There are a couple of issues that could be considered when addressing the groundwater compliance.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked how much water is being treated and used at the golf course. Ms. Bingham stated a report is available for commission review, which includes a lot of information. Commissioner Elsaesser asked if this becomes an issue, what is the timeframe of when it needs to be addressed. Ms. Bingham stated that would be up to DEQ. Hopefully the compliance numbers will continue to decrease. Commissioner Elsaesser asked did the groundwater numbers go up with the improvements to the park. Ms. Bingham stated no, it would take up to five years before the changes in groundwater could be seen.

Commissioner Elsaesser stated he recognizes that Centennial Park would have been irrigated more the first two years. Hopefully, the groundwater numbers will go down. He stated it is important the methane monitoring district was established and removed those costs from residential and commercial solid waste.

Commissioner Haladay commented when the decision comes forward on the assessment, he asked that the commission get a specific breakdown on what the one-year increase would be versus the five years.

Ms. Bingham cautioned there may not be enough time prior to the irrigation season to get this project completed.

Consensus Direction to the Manager – Continue to work with DEQ to on implementation of the plan; provide the breakdown in cost and bring forward a recommendation for the increase in the rate assessment. This will come forward prior to the rest of the rate assessment hearings.

HATS 5311 Grant request, Coordination Plan, Capital Requests

Manager Alles introduced the agenda item. This budget being presented today, the commission will review it again during the regular budget process. It is his recommendation to add an additional 75,000 for another fixed route by removing one para transit route and making arrangements for the para transit riders to be picked up through an agreement with another service. Manager Alles noted even with the additional \$75,000, there is no guarantee that it will fund the entire costs of a fixed route.

Manager Alles noted he has made a request of the county for assistance on the identification of the fixed routes. He has also asked HATAC to work with city staff to identify the fixed routes.

HATS Supervisor Larson reported staff is seeking guidance from the Commission on the assumptions that staff should use in developing the FY16 transit preliminary budget. Listed below are the initial assumptions staff has used for revenues, personnel, operating, & capital budgets in the HATS, East

Valley and Head Start budgets. The draft budgets are attached. Staff will make any Commission approved changes after the February 4th work session. These grant budgets are due to the Montana Department of Transportation by March 2, 2015 (**Please keep in mind that this is just the budget for grant submittal purposes to show how we intend to spend all of the 5311 grant allocation**). The Commission will be able to adjust this budget throughout the normal City budget process.

HATS REVENUES:

- Operating 5311 funding grant: We have been informed that the grant will be \$707,117.16 for FY 2016. There is no contingency funding amount in this year's award. HATS' funding with the contingency for FY 2015 was \$636,232.56. This is an increase of \$70,884.60.
- According to MDT, this new grant amount is the result of a 5% increase based on our FY14 approved total expenditures.
- The 5311 grant is assumed to be split between HATS (90%) and East Valley (10%) similar to last year's allocation split.
- The New Freedom 5317 grant program has been discontinued by the FTA. This was a Rocky Mountain Development Council (RMDC) grant that was passed through HATS as the lead agency. RMDC used the grant to fund Senior Transportation.
- The Transade grant will continue in FY16 in the amount of \$45,692, near last year's level of \$50,000.
- HATS transit fares and advertising revenues are projected to remain constant. No increase/decrease in fares was assumed.
- The General Fund contribution was increased \$75,000 to a total of \$375,000. The \$75,000 was included to explore how the ADA para-transit demand could be reduced to allow for the start-up of a second fixed route. The concept is that one ADA bus could be used on the new fixed route and the \$75,000 could be used to meet peak demand for ADA para-transit. This could be either a contracted service or by using a bus/driver within HATS. In order to reduce the existing ADA service demand, the federal ¼ mile buffer rule from the fixed route may have to be implemented. The true cost of this option is unknown but the exploration might provide the opportunity to begin a second fixed route.
- No cash donations or in-kind contributions are anticipated.

HATS PERSONNEL:

- Cost of Living (COLA) was estimated at .76% equal to the CPI-U (Budget Office).
- PERS retirement percentage was increased 1.224% based on State Law (Budget Office).
- Health Insurance was increased 8% based on budget office estimate.
- Vision, Dental and the Employee assistance program expenditures were increased 5% based on budget office estimates.
- Worker's compensation, liability insurance and fidelity insurance rates were based on budget office estimates.
- Temporary salaries/hours were increased to cover the actual hours of vacations and sick leave earned by permanent staff. Temporary salaries are needed to cover shifts when a permanent driver is absent. This line item was under budgeted in FY15.
- Salaries were budgeted to allow for four buses. This has historically been used to fund one fixed route bus that operates on a 75 minute schedule from 7:00 a.m. - 6:00 p.m. (an additional hour per day is budgeted to allow for maintenance of buses.) and three Curb-to-Curb buses from 6:30 a.m. - 5:30 p.m. (an additional hour per day is budgeted to allow for maintenance of buses.).

HATS OPERATIONS:

- Supplies and Materials are projected to increase slightly (\$950) mostly due to adding employee lockers at the HATS facility.
- Purchased Services are projected to increase by \$91,310. \$75,000 was included to explore how the ADA para-transit demand could be reduced to allow for the start-up of a second fixed route. The concept is that one ADA bus could be used on the new fixed route and the \$75,000 could be used to meet peak demand for ADA para-transit. This could be either a contracted service or by using a bus/driver within HATS. In order to reduce the existing ADA service demand, the federal ¼ mile buffer rule from the fixed route may have to be implemented. The true cost of this option is unknown but the exploration might provide the opportunity to begin a second fixed route. Other increases were for the snowplowing contract (\$12,000) to address ADA concerns at bus stops

and to plow/sand at the Transit Building and adding a camera system in one of the buses (\$3,500).

- Intra-City Charges are projected to remain unchanged.
- Fixed Costs are projected to decrease \$50,300. This reflects the end of the New Freedom grant (\$30,850) and the one-time MILP contract (\$22,450). Revenues to the HATS fund will decrease by a like amount.
- Internal Charges are projected to increase \$8,915. This assumes an increase of 5% for most internal charges. Final internal charge numbers are not yet available.

HATS CAPITAL:

- Bus Stop improvements, such as shelters, will need to be carried over in the FY15 budget. Staff's request was unsuccessful in FY 2015 application. Staff will resubmit a capital grant request for bus stop improvements in March for inclusion in the FY16 budget (\$71,100).
- Request for one new fixed route bus (\$38,670). This amount reflects the 13.42% match requirement and not the full cost of a bus.
- Request the Fixed Route component to our Route Match ADA Para-Transit software. This software will not only provide us with the digital information for the fixed route service but will also provide us with real time bus tracking for our ridership (\$6,710). This amount reflects the 13.42% match requirement and not the full cost of the software.
- ADA Para-transit notification software module (\$15,600).

HATS CASH FLOW:

- The FY15 projected budget shows that HATS expenditures will exceed revenues by \$81,607 and capital reserves will drop to \$106,062. The adopted FY15 budget showed that expenditures would exceed revenues by \$57,368. Why did the deficit increase by \$24,239? The significant changes to the FY15 budget are shown below:
 - a. The FY15 projection for temporary salaries increased \$13,711 (explanation above).
 - b. Capital increased \$18,990 due to a bus that was budgeted in FY14 that didn't arrive by the end of the fiscal year and was carried over into FY15.
 - c. The expenditure pass through amount for the New Freedom grant wasn't budgeted and was amended 10/16/2014 (\$30,850)
 - d. The City entered into a MOU with MILP (MT. Independent Living Project) and estimated expenditures to be \$22,450 for that program.
 - e. Revenues increased \$22,450 for MILP, \$30,850 for New Freedoms, \$310 for Transade, and \$5,307 in State Aid to Transportation.
 - f. Overall, expenditures increased \$83,011 and revenues increased \$58,772 for a difference of \$24,239.
- The FY16 projected budget shows that HATS expenditures will exceed revenues by \$22,264 and the capital reserve will drop again to \$78,128. The capital reserve has historically been used to fund bus replacements and other capital purchases.
- 100% of the 5311 grant award is projected to be spent.

"ROBUST" BUDGET PACKAGE

- HATAC has recommended the following to be incorporated in the FY15 and FY16 Transit budgets (from memo dated 12/18/2014 and e-mails received 1/26/2015). Staff has used and noted HATAC/consultant estimates when possible (*) and has attempted to show the assumptions used to provide estimated costs for the other recommendations when possible.

FY15 Vehicle Wraps (5 buses * \$6,000) = \$30,000*

FY15 Bus Stop Signage (\$125 each * 50 stops) = \$6,250*

Total FY15 Estimated Additional Request = \$36,250

FY16 Vehicle Wraps? (5 buses * \$6,000) = \$30,000

FY16 Bus Stop Signage Replacements (\$125 *5) = \$625

FY16 #1 - Additional Fixed Route (3,250 hrs x \$75.00/hr) = \$243,750

FY16 #2 - Brand/Marketing (\$10,000*/yr estimate. Current = \$7,750) = \$2,250

FY16 #3 - Mobility Manager (132/5 w/benefits) = \$66,282

FY16 #4 - Local Match Program = No cost

FY16 #5 - HATS Holiday Service (10 holidays, 5 buses x 13 hrs x 10 days x \$75) = \$48,750

FY16 #5 - E.V. Holiday Service (10 holidays, 1 bus x 9 hrs x 10 days x \$75) = \$6,750

FY16 #6 - Using ADA Taxi Service (7,500 rides * \$13.00 per ride) = \$97,500

Total FY16 Estimated Additional Request = \$495,907

- If advertising revenues are discontinued as part of the re-branding effort, the loss of revenue would be approximately \$7,400 based on the FY16 projection.
- After further refinement and discussion with the City Commission, any or all of these recommendations could be added to the budget as a package if additional operational dollars become available either through donation or MDT. As of Thursday, January 29, 2015, the Montana Department of Transportation said there is no benefit to the City of adding the robust budget package to the grant request. According to our regulators, the Coordination Plan is where they would like to see these recommendations.

EAST VALLEY REVENUES:

- The Lewis & Clark County contribution to the East Valley bus is shown at \$43,500. This is \$11,500 higher than the initial FY15 contribution of \$32,000 but \$6,500 less than the \$50,000 the County ultimately agreed to in order to keep the East Valley operation at five days per week.
- The City of East Helena contribution is assumed to remain at the FY15 level of \$3,200.
- East Valley transit fares and advertising revenues are projected to remain constant. No increase/decrease in fares was assumed.

EAST VALLEY PERSONNEL:

- Cost of Living (COLA) was estimated at .76% equal to the CPI-U (Budget Office).
- PERS retirement percentage was increased 1.224% based on State Law (Budget Office).
- Health Insurance was increased 8% based on budget office estimate.
- Vision, Dental and the Employee assistance program expenditures were increased 5% based on budget office estimates.
- Worker's Compensation rates were based on budget office estimates.
- Salaries were budgeted to allow for one East Valley bus serving East Helena and the unincorporated East Valley area, operating on an hourly route for eight hours each day our operation is open (an additional hour per day is budgeted to allow for maintenance of buses).

EAST VALLEY OPERATIONS:

- Supplies and Materials are projected to increase \$150.00 to more accurately reflect the East Valley portion of the overall cost of supplies and materials.
- Purchased Services are projected to increase \$952.00 mostly due to the increase in the snowplowing contract to address ADA concerns at bus stops and to plow/sand at the Transit Building.
- Intra-City Charges are projected to remain unchanged.
- Internal Charges are projected to increase \$1,439. This assumes an increase of 5% for most internal charges. Final internal charge numbers are not yet available.

EAST VALLEY CAPITAL:

- No capital purchases are anticipated.

EAST VALLEY CASH FLOW:

- The East Valley Cash Flow is essentially balanced using all of the above assumptions. The FY16 projected ending operating reserve balance is \$10,043. The optimum operating reserve for this type of fund is approximately 1/12 of the total operating expenditures or \$10,075 (\$120,894/12).
- The East Valley fund is projected to use \$70,712 (10%) of the 5311 grant funds available to the City.
- 100% of the 5311 grant award is projected to be spent.

HEAD START REVENUES:

- It is assumed that RMDC Head Start will cover 100% of their costs to the City of Helena.

HEAD START PERSONNEL:

- Cost of Living (COLA) was estimated at .76% equal to the CPI-U (Budget Office).
- PERS retirement percentage was increased 1.224% based on State Law (Budget Office).
- Health Insurance was increased 8% based on budget office estimate.

- Vision, Dental and the Employee assistance program expenditures were increased 5% based on budget office estimates.
- Worker's Compensation rates were based on budget office estimates.
- RMDC does not believe there will any additional staff or route deductions this year.

HEAD START OPERATIONS:

- Supplies and Materials and Purchased Services are projected to remain unchanged.
- Intra-City charges are projected to decrease due to reduced fuel usage and lower costs projected for repairs/parts.
- Internal Charges are projected to increase \$627.00. This assumes an increase of 5% for most internal charges. Final internal charge numbers are not yet available.

HEAD START CAPITAL:

- No capital purchases are anticipated.

HEAD START CASH FLOW:

- This cash flow should always be balanced due to Head Start paying for 100% of the costs of operating this program.

COUNTY TRANSIT GRANT UPDATE:

- The Board of County Commissioners accepted Round 1 project outputs in November, 2013. Round 2 was never officially closed as the funder allowed the County to extend the project and include Round 3 as a continuation of and addition to Round 2 efforts.
- The County has not completed the implementation of the branding and marketing efforts because the final Round 2 product development requires approval of the new name and the new brand by the City Commission before brochures and website are created. The County also wants to make sure the new routes are approved by the City Commission before the route maps are finalized.
- Round 3 includes a continuation of branding and marketing effort including a Transit Summit which would be the launch event, funding and advocacy coalition building to secure funding sources for increased services, and regional concept review and strategies for funding a regional improvement.
- A consultant is under contract to complete a governance model review using the round 2 and round 3 grant. This is projected to be completed in the next month or two.
- Round 2 and Round 3 are scheduled to be completed by November, 2015.
- The City Commission has not formally accepted the recommendations included in the County Transit Grant. Does the City Commission want staff to bring the recommendations when completed forward for acceptance?

Lastly, the City Commission will need to take formal action on the following items:

- Approve the FY16 MDOT grant allocation request before March 1, 2015. The total request includes the FY 2016 preliminary budget, 2016 Coordination Plan including HATS and other partner's capital requests.

The commission is scheduled to review and discuss the HATS grant application at today's and the February 18th administrative meetings. Formal permission to submit the grant application is scheduled for the February 23rd commission meeting.

Manager Alles reiterated the budget has to be submitted to MDT by March 2nd; he has tentatively put this on the February 18th administrative meeting, if additional discussion is needed.

In order to reduce the existing ADA service demand, the federal ¾ mile buffer rule from the fixed route may have to be implemented. The true cost of this option is unknown but the exploration might provide the opportunity to begin a second fixed route, in order to do that the fixed route may have to stay inside the city limits.

The Coordination Plan also needs to be submitted; however, HATAC has not submitted the final version for the commission to review and consider.

Manager Alles referred to the "Robust budget" and noted there have been discussions on what should be submitted. He has had conversations with MDT representatives Tom Stuber and Lynn Zanto and how staff has included the separated package is how MDT wants to see it. MDT will look at the robust items and make recommendations for additional funding.

Mayor Smith asked for public comment.

Elizabeth Andrews, HATAC Chair, congratulated the city for providing the Capital Shuttle, this is a great service. She then addressed the commission on HATAC's roll on submitting their recommendations. Ms. Andrews gave a copy of the Draft Coordination Plan to the city manager and commission. She encouraged the commission to build a budget that adopts the recommendations from HATAC. The HATAC committee will be voting on the Coordination Plan at their February meeting.

Brian Johnson, HATAC Treasurer, noted there is time between now and March 2nd for the lead agency and HATAC to continue their discussions on the budget. He spoke of the many volunteer boards that make budget recommendations to government entities. Mr. Johnson again stated the City should work with HATAC to come together on the budget recommendations.

Bob Maffitt noted it is an interesting outcome the members of HATAC has had working with city staff on building a plan and making recommendations. Mr. Maffitt noted there needs to be additional discussion on the budget; he asked the commission to review the plan and consider all the recommendations. He is excited about the city recognizing a way to pencil a perceived plan/budget to accomplish the recommendations.

Mr. Maffitt spoke of the 25th Anniversary of the ADA Act and reported there will be a community celebration on July 3rd. It would be wonderful to have an integrated transportation system implemented by July 2015.

Head Start Family Advocate Jaymie Sheldahl spoke in the support of HATAC's recommendations. If the services are expanded, people will use it.

Debora Swingley noted she has sent an email to the commission in support of HATAC recommendations being included in the budget. It is the intent of HATAC to reach out to community partners for additional funding.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated she is confused on what is in the budget for an additional fixed route. City Manager Alles stated the current budget pays for one modified fix route, one fixed route and the para transit service. With the increase of the \$75,000 of general funds and the elimination of one para transit bus, it will make it possible to add a fixed route and then pay a private contractor to pick up the para transit demand.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath asked if HATAC is recommending a third fixed route. Manager Alles stated as he understands the proposal, HATAC is recommending leaving the three para transit routes, one fixed route, the east valley route and adding another fixed route at a cost of approximately \$220,000 to \$240,000.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath referred to HATAC's FY16 #4 recommendation and noted there is no cost for the local match program. HATS Supervisor Larson noted the change being recommended is the in-kind form; HATAC would like to be able to designate any in-kind match to specific projects and the current form does not allow the in-kind match to designate the use.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated if the second fixed route is implemented are the costs to replace the bus stop signs included in staff's budget request. HATS Supervisor Larson stated this recommendation would spill over into the re-branding effort. Manager Alles referred to page two of the memo and noted under HATS Capital it includes bus stop improvements, such as shelters.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath commented some of the items listed under the "Robust" budget are also included with staff's budget proposal. Manager Alles stated to some extent, that is true; Assistant Public Works Director Hauck has marked some items with an "*" that are included in staff's budget and is a recommendation from HATAC. For example, to do the holiday service for east valley, staff had to estimate how much it would costs to run the service.

Commissioner Elsaesser stated he has served on HATAC and noted this is the year of the bus. He recognized and thanked Supervisor Larson and HATAC members for the work that has been accomplished. Commissioner Elsaesser stated he is ready to make the switch to a central fixed route system that will serve the entire community. With the change it will give large employers and other entities the opportunity to participate.

Commissioner Elsaesser stated he believes we are very close in looking at the six goals HATAC has brought forward. There are components that are not covered, such as the mobility manager position. We are seeing if the grant continues to provide capacity that might fill that role, so the commission could review what the mobility manager position might look like. Once we have fixed routes, the most pressing need might be is how to coordinate all the other transit services. If the in-kind

contributions can be clearly defined, we can bridge that gap as far as what in-kind categories there are; i.e. mobility manager, continuing consultant work, studies and/or a number of other categories.

Commissioner Elsaesser stated City Manager has a good start with this budget and there is clear commission direction to expand services to the fixed routes and move forward with the re-branding for at least a portion of the buses. Finally to have a system that large employers can invest in and all other entities can collaborate with. Commissioner Elsaesser recognized how successful the Capital Shuttle is and the only comments he has heard from riders is they like to see a tip jar.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked in the capital budget request, is the recommendation for the city to do a partnership with the cab company to assure there is 24-7 service for those who qualify for para-transit service.

Supervisor Larson explained one of HATAC's roles and responsibilities was to come up with the finalized list for commission consideration for the city's ranking. HATAC has ranked MILP's application as #1 and the city's application as #2. Supervisor Larson noted the bus included in the city's application would be a fixed route bus. This bus would not have a lift; it would be a low floor bus with a ramp.

Supervisor Larson noted also in the Capital budget request are two software packages; one that will let riders know where the bus is and one that will expand the para transit notification software. MDT will review the applications for capital in October and if awarded, it would be Feb/March before implementation. Therefore, to begin using the software, the recommendation is to purchase these two software packages and not wait for MDT.

Commissioner Elsaesser noted there have been discussions on riders not using the bus due to different scenarios and the software packages would be beneficial and help with customer service. He asked how to prioritize this, if the commission is making a final decision at the next administrative meeting, he suggested putting the Capital Taxi para transit service ahead of the city's other priorities, may be the only option to assure there is 24-7 service. Commissioner Elsaesser suggested the city purchase a van to assist with providing the service.

Mayor Smith stated he is going to have a hard time supporting an additional \$75,000 from general fund to increase services. He has advocated the last couple of years that Lewis & Clark County should be the lead agency for HATS.

Commissioner Ellison shared Mayor Smith's thoughts with adding \$75,000 of general funds to the HATS Budget; which would be a 25% increase for FY16. Commissioner Ellison posed the question to those who spoke today, whose recommendation is to add an additional \$165,000 to the budget, what other general fund line item is going to be increased 25%. Commissioner Ellison noted other department's budgets would not be increased by 25% and Manager Alles is trying to implement another fixed route, which was the direction the commission gave him. Commissioner Ellison stated he wants hear the details and have assurances that the \$75,000 will pay for the implementation of an additional fixed route. Once he knows all the details, he will make the decision on whether to support it or not.

Commissioner Ellison referred to the "Robust" budget that includes an additional ½ million dollars to implement the package and asked where the funding is coming from without impacting the general fund and the other departments. Commissioner Ellison stated the increase of \$495,907 is not realistic to implement HATAC's recommendations. He has heard the City Manager is not working collaboratively with an advisory board on the budget and needs to spend more time doing that. However, Manager Alles has brought forward a budget and it will be difficult to support unless there are some assurances in there on what type of services will be delivered.

Commissioner Ellison stated he is ready to support submitting the grant to MDT and having further discussions on what specific line items will look like. Commissioner Ellison stated his support comes with the caveat there may be the need for fine tuning the budget, maybe not adding services but the possibility of trimming services.

HATAC member Brian Johnson stated the HATAC members do not expect the city to come up with any further funds. He then addressed the in-kind form that Supervisor Larson had referenced and noted it is not about a form, it about a new philosophy. HATAC members believe there are partners in the community that would help fund the additional services.

Commissioner Haladay commented to start with, the transit budget is woefully underfunded and to compare the increase to other fully funded departments is a false iconomy. HATAC and the commission have grand ideas and the \$75,000 is a fantastic idea, the commission needs to extend transit services. Last year, the commission was assured the change from curb to curb to para transit would result in being able to add another fixed route. However, that did not work out; all of these plans have not

worked out. The city should not maintain status quo. Commissioner Haladay noted he has asked in the past and has not received an answer on how the City of Butte can operate a system that has more service and a smaller budget.

Commissioner Haladay commented the \$75,000 will purchase a service and will not require an additional bus to be put on the streets; which essentially will save funds; the city cannot keep status quo and tell the community it is the year of the bus. He is not ready to give the transit system away and the commission has to be willing to fund it.

Mayor Smith noted staff and the commission believed the para transit would work out and an additional fixed route would have been added.

Commissioner Ellison stated \$75,000 is a 25% increase and is not a status quo budget. The city manager has not proposed a status quo budget and the city has moved forward in providing different services. He too was disappointed that the 2nd fixed route didn't work out. Manager Alles has given the commission a budget with a 25% increase.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated she would again advocate putting parking meters at the capital complex and encourage people to use the shuttle. The revenue from the parking meters would help provide services.

Commissioner Elsaesser stated as ADA requirements were implemented, the data shows there is more demand for the service than what the city is providing. He believes it is imperative to implement the fixed routes. He also referenced Butte and Bozeman running successful transit systems. Commissioner Elsaesser stated he will support the additional \$75,000 and sub-contract the para-transit service. The city has delayed too long with implementing fixed routes.

Manager Alles commented he does not believe at any time city staff promised by eliminating the curb side service and going to the para transit service, would assure a fixed route. If that is how the commission interpreted it, he apologizes. Manager Alles stated he cannot promise the \$75,000 will cover the expenses to fill the void of the para transit. Staff has explored how Butte runs their transit system and can present the information to the commission at an upcoming meeting.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath asked Mayor Smith to poll the commission to see if there is support for the re-branding, if funding becomes available for signage. Manager Alles Ron stated HATAC has recommended the city seek approval of the new brand and the lead agency work to accomplish the rebranding of the buses and bus stop signage. The costs to re-brand five buses is \$30,000 and to resign the bus stop is \$6,250 for a total of \$36,250.

Commissioner Elsaesser stated he would support the re-branding effort, however, not at the expense of delaying the delaying getting the fixed routes. Commissioner Haque-Hausrath concurred with Commissioner Elsaesser

Commissioners Ellison and Haladay also concurred if the funds can be found. Mayor Smith stated he would leave the re-branding to the new lead agency, if there is one.

Consensus Direction to the Manager - Move forward with the two recommendations for re-branding, contingent upon the comments above.

6. Committee discussions

- a) Audit Committee, City-County Board of Health, Civic Center Board, L&C County Mental Health Advisory Committee, Montana League of Cities & Towns – No report given.
- b) Audit Committee, Board of Adjustment, Helena Chamber of Commerce Liaison, Information Technology Committee, Transportation Coordinating Committee — No report given.
- c) Intergovernmental Transit Committee, Non-Motorized Travel Advisory Board, Transportation Coordinating Committee – No report given.
- d) ADA Compliance Committee, Business Improvement District/Helena Parking Commission, City-County Parks Board, Montana Business Assistance Connection – No report given.
- e) Audit Committee, City-County Administration Building (CCAB), Public Art Committee – No report given.

7. Helena Citizens Council – HCC Representative Dick Sloan presented the following two HCC recommendations to the city commission:

- The HCC unanimously voted to recommend that the City Commission review and address the existing sidewalk snow removal policy and make any necessary changes to make it viable and enforceable.

Mayor Smith thanked Mr. Sloan for the recommendation. He then stated at this time, he is willing to consider the city purchasing a fleet of four-wheelers with snow plows mounted and hire people to go around town and remove the snow from sidewalks. The sidewalks could be treated like the streets and be paid out of street maintenance. However, he recognized that street maintenance could not be used.

Commissioner Elsaesser stated the commission will be discussing the snow removal ordinance at a future administrative meeting and the HCC recommendation will be a part of that discussion. Manager Alles reported staff has identified some streets, where residents will be informed when the snow plow will be in the area and asked not to park on the street.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated she would be interested to know what the costs would be to treat the sidewalks the same as the streets. She then asked whether the draft snow removal ordinance includes snow removal from the ADA ramps. City Attorney Jodoin commented the draft ordinance is copied from the City of Bozeman. He also spoke of staff's frustration of the current sidewalk snow removal ordinance.

- In keeping with the purpose of this Council to advise the City Commission on actions to improve quality of life for our citizens, the HCC recommends that the City Commission analyze the current quiet zone rail crossing improvement proposal based on the FRA requirements, consider less costly materials and methods and prioritize the quiet zone project in the next budget cycle with a goal of establishing a quiet zone in Helena by the end of 2015.

In 2010, the HCC addressed the quiet zone issue and found that approximately 50% of 500 people interviewed agreed that a quiet zone is necessary. The current costs estimates for five crossing is approximately \$987,000. HCC representative Sloan spoke on the additional research that has been done regarding the quiet zone.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated the cost of \$987,000 is incorrect. HCC representative Sloan concurred and noted the estimated costs is approximately \$600,000. Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated there is a consensus number of commissioners who have indicated support for funding the quiet zone out of the protested taxes. She reiterated her support and agreed the commission should look at the least expensive method to implement the quiet zone.

Commissioner Elsaesser agreed with Commissioner Haque-Hausrath comments and stated he is open to all options on funding.

Mayor Smith commented the commission has had one discussion on the allocation of the protested taxes and he does not feel there was commission consensus on the allocation of the protested taxes. The commission will discuss this at an upcoming administrative meeting. Recent correspondence between the city and MRL open up some possibilities.

Manager Alles reported the city is using the same consultant as Whitefish used for their quiet zone. City Engineer Leland noted the consultant received the HCC recommendation and will respond.

HCC representative Sloan reiterated the HCC's interested in participating in the recycling discussion.

Commissioner Haladay commented when the commission discussed the allocation of the protested taxes, there were three commissioners who want to use some of the protested taxes for the quiet zone.

8. Review of agenda for February 9, 2015 City Commission meeting – No discussion held.

9. Public Comment – No public comment received.

10. Commission discussion and direction to the City Manager – No discussion held.

11. Adjourn – Meeting adjourned at 6:10 p.m.