

SUMMARY OF ADMINISTRATIVE MEETING
September 5, 2018– 4:00 p.m.
City Commission Chambers, Room 330, City-County Building
316 N. Park Avenue

1. Call to order, introductions, opening comments – Mayor Collins called the meeting to order. Commissioners Farris-Olsen; Haladay, Noonan and O’Loughlin were present. Staff present was: City Manager Dennis Taylor; City Attorney Thomas Jodoin; Police Chief Troy McGee; Fire Chief Mark Emert; Community Development Director Sharon Haugen; Planner Lucy Morell-Gengler; Public Works Director Randall Camp; City Engineer Ryan Leland; Street Superintendent David Knoepke; Parks & Recreation Director Amy Teegarden; Open Lands Manager Brad Langsather; Administrative Services Director Glenn Jorgenson; Budget Manager Libbi Lovshin; and City Clerk Debbie Havens.

Others in attendance included: HCC Representative Sumner Sharpe

2. August 8, 2018 Administrative Summary – The August 8, 2018 administrative meeting summary was approved as submitted.

3. Commission comments, questions –

Upcoming Appointments – Mayor Collins will be recommending the following appointments at the September 10th city commission meeting:

Board of Adjustment

Reappointment of George McCauley, as the alternate member, to a second term on the Board of Adjustment. Term will begin upon appointment and expire October 31, 2021.

Business Improvement District/Helena Parking Commission

Reappointment of Mark Roylance to a second term on the BID/HPC. Term will begin upon appointment and expire October 31, 2022.

Bill Roberts Golf Course Advisory Board

Reappointment of Pete Aspinwall to a second term on the Golf Advisory Board. Term will begin upon appointment and expire October 30, 2021.

City-County Parks Board

Reappointment of Pat Doyle to a second term on the Parks Board. Term will begin upon appointment and expire September 30, 2021.

4. City Manager’s Report – Manager Taylor introduced Alan Miller, Executive Assistant to the City Manager.

City Commission Seat Vacancy – City Manager referred the commission to his memo that outlined the process he is recommending to use to replace Commissioner Farris-Olsen upon his resignation.

Commissioner O’Loughlin thanked Manager Taylor for the information and noted the timeline makes sense; with the deadline of October 31st it gives the commission time to think of the process.

Manager Taylor noted the four remaining commission members will vote on the replacement of Commissioner Farris-Olsen.

Commissioner Farris-Olsen stated he will make the recommended timeline work.

Front Street Project – City Manager Taylor reported the Front Street project will be bid out later this fall. It is staff’s belief better bids will be received. Engineer Leland showed the overall project layout map for Front Street and what a complete street will look like. The project will include stormwater and water main replacements. Total project costs is 3.6 million with the following breakdown: Streets improvements \$1.77 million; Stormwater \$1.2 million; Water \$670,000. Funding will be Gas Tax

\$630,000; New Gas Tax \$209,000; Street Maintenance \$910,000; Water \$410,000; and Stormwater, \$1,130,000.

Cruse Alignment – City Manager Taylor updated the commission on where staff is on the Cruse Alignment. Engineer Leland showed the commission a typical section of a complete street along Cruse Avenue; staff can shrink down the design to gain adjacent right of way. A TA grant has been applied for.

Commissioner Haladay asked what the current right-of-way on Cruse Avenue is. Engineer Leland noted the right-of-way varies from 80 to 100 feet. Commissioner Haladay stated the proposed street is 46 to 50 feet wide; which leaves 10 to 15 feet on both sides for right of way. He then referred to the area of Cruse Avenue from South Park to Broadway and asked what a developable lot is. Engineer Leland stated from Park Avenue up to Cutler and adjacent to the Helena Housing Authority property, there would be enough right-of-way for a developable lot; however, from the bridge on Cruse to Broadway there isn't a lot of property that could be developed. Commissioner Haladay stated if we reconfigure the design we could pick up another 15 feet or more of right of way. Engineer Leland stated the developable property is limited, if you do not incur expenses to deal with some of the topography. The street is centered; however, the proposal would be to use the right of way on one side of the street.

Land Trust Update – City Manager Taylor reported a representative from Montana Land Trust will meet with the commission and staff on Friday, September 21st at 10:00 a.m.

5. **Department Discussions** **Community Development**

Subdivision Regulations – Planner Morell-Gengler reported the revisions to the City Subdivision Regulations have been prompted by legislative changes to the Montana Code Annotated (MCA) amending the Montana Subdivision and Platting Act (MSPA) which affect local subdivision regulations. Although, most of the proposed revisions to the city regulations are to incorporate legislative amendments, additional changes are proposed to address the Legacy Ranch court ruling regarding public participation and extensions of preliminary plat approval. Comments from a stakeholders meeting and staff initiated proposals were also taken into consideration. A Consolidated Planning Board work session was held on October 19, 2017 to review proposed changes and to solicit comments on the planned amendments to the subdivision regulations. The Planning Board held a public hearing on November 21, 2017 and voted to recommend the proposed changes to the city subdivision regulations.

Changes to Section 12-2-16 were incorporated that require the installation of water and wastewater systems and appurtenances serving all lots to be final platted and streets installed to a minimum all weather surface that can accommodate emergency access. The requirement for installation of a functioning storm water system and sidewalks prior to final plat would not be specifically called out but would be addressed on a case by case basis. Necessary improvements not installed prior to final plat approval would still require a financial guarantee with established time frames for installation of those improvements.

The proposed changes to the city subdivision regulations were presented to the City Commission at an administrative meeting on March 21, 2018. The Commission noted at that meeting that previous revision to the city subdivision regulations relating to installation of sidewalks generated considerable interest and discussion in the community. The Commission requested that staff meet with various groups, specifically the ADA Committee, Non-Motorized Travel Advisory Committee; Helena Citizens Council and Montanan Independent Living Project, to discuss the proposed changes to the subdivision sidewalk installation proposal.

Staff held a stakeholders meeting April 12, 2018 to discuss the proposed changes to the sidewalk installation timing for subdivision final plats. A list of invitees and attendees was provided to the commission. A summary of the meeting was sent to both attendees and invitees with an invitation to provide further comments. Written comments from interested individuals and the minutes from the HCC April 25, 2018 meeting, which includes their recommendation, are included.

The Planning Board recommendation is as follows:

In lieu of the completion of the construction of public improvements not identified in subsection A above, prior to the approval of a final plat, the subdivider may provide a bond or other reasonable security, in an amount and with surety and conditions satisfactory to the city that provide for and secure the construction and installation of the remaining required improvements within eighteen (18) months

from the date of final plat approval. Reasonable time extension may be granted by the city commission provided bonding or other security is also extended. The amount of the bond or security may be reduced in accordance with completion and final city acceptance of portions of the required improvements.

Planner Morell-Gengler noted if there is commission consensus, staff is prepared to bring the entire packet of recommendations on Subdivision Regulations to a commission meeting in October.

Commissioner Haladay stated originally there was a group of developers who supported the 18-months, which is the recommendation. What has changed to have a different recommendation from the HBIA, Helena Chamber of Commerce and the Helena Area Realtors.

Public Comment – Mayor Collins asked for public comment; the following persons addressed the commission: Joel Peden; MILP, recommended the sidewalks are installed within the 18-months. Sidewalks allow accessibility for those with mobility limitations. Mr. Peden stated a variance on the 18-months should be an exception and not the norm. Another recommendation is to include the ADA Committee when a variance is requested. Commissioner Haladay clarified the 18-months to install the sidewalk is a right as long as the financial guarantee is provided. Attorney Jodoin concurred. Mr. Peden noted he thought each sidewalk would not be an automatic of up to 18-months. Everyone has the right to travel safely.

Donna Durkel; Helena Building Association Executive Director, addressed Commissioner Haladay's comment on what has changed where the building industry does not support the 18-months. The issue has percolated within their industry and has become a discussion point. There is a common concern with safety; however, private development is different than infrastructure. It is their recommendation the sidewalks will be done; it is a matter of timing and how many times the sidewalks have to be reconstructed.

Judy Erickson stated she represents a lot of disabled citizens and her concerns are with shoveling the snow and ice. Her recommendation is to install sidewalks and keep them clean.

Mark Runkle submitted a written handout and noted this is a balancing situation; the only solution is rapid build out. Commissioner O'Loughlin asked if the 18-months is a helpful timeframe. Mr. Runkle stated the timeline should be up to five years, he believes the 18-months timeline would discourage development. Timeline for total build-out should be five years and the sidewalks could then be installed.

Commissioner O'Loughlin noted there is nothing against the city extending the time beyond the 18 months if the commission believes it is necessary. Planner Morell-Gengler explained a subdivision has to have preliminary plat and final plat. The commission sets the condition at the preliminary plat stage; for the installation of infrastructure. If the 18-month financial guarantee expires, the developer would have to request an extension and there is not a limit on how many extensions can be requested.

Commissioner Haladay stated in 12-16-B the commission may require public improvements to be installed and completed prior to obtaining final plat approval on a case by case basis if there is a finding that the public improvements are necessary to protect public health and safety. Planner Morell-Gengler concurred the commission could require the installation of sidewalks prior to final plat approval and not provide the option of financial guarantee. Commissioner Haladay asked if the commission chooses not to require the sidewalks be installed based on the public health and safety, at that point the choice is left up to the developer to either install the infrastructure or financial guarantee it for 18-months. Planner Morell-Gengler concurred.

Rick Ahmann, Realtor, spoke on the housing crisis which is driven by a lack of inventory. Staff has referenced how the process works; the current commission has not considered any subdivisions. Mr. Ahmann stated in the new housing market, 3-4 houses are being built in the county to every one in Helena. He concurred with the recommendation to look at the five year option.

Commissioner Haladay asked Attorney Jodoin in regards to the required bond or security, in which the commission recently discussed regarding the house on the city easement, how it would work with the five years recommendation, is it secure and would we have issues with solvency. Attorney Jodoin stated the same concerns do not exist, his office has required a letter of credit from a local bank. However, there will always be exceptions like Stone Meadows. Whether it is 18-months or five years, the city will require a letter of credit from a local bank. The question would be how much to require in the letter of credit if it is for five years.

Mike McGree, Caterpillar, spoke of the safety issue with large equipment crossing a sidewalk; you do not want pedestrians walking on a sidewalk during the construction phase. He addressed the letter of credit and the city could request a 120% letter of credit.

Commissioner Haladay asked what kind of follow-up we currently have with a deferment; if five years is approved, how do we assure sidewalks are installed. Attorney Jodoin stated staff currently monitors the current 18-months; we haven't had to address it with the new rules. However, a new process would need to be developed and implemented. The commission has the authority to order sidewalks in at any time. Commissioner Haladay stated he has concerns with tracking the five year timeframe.

Commissioner Noonan asked what the timeline is now and what the expectation today is. Planner Morell-Gengler stated the expectation today is sidewalks will be installed prior to final plat approval or financially guaranteed. Commissioner Noonan asked when the commission will make a decision on the timeframe for the installation of sidewalks. Planner Morell-Gengler stated staff is prepared to bring the entire package forward to a city commission meeting in October.

Commissioner Haladay stated what we have as the recommendation is 18-months; and he believes the commission could move forward with. However, Mr. Peden's comments have to be taken into consideration. Five years is too long to assure the sidewalks are installed and the 18-months is an acceptable time to require the sidewalks be installed. He asked staff to develop a process where a variance request would be forwarded to the ADA Committee for comments.

Commissioner Farris-Olsen concurred with Commissioner Haladay's comments; five years is too long. He believes the recommendation of 18-months will alleviate the concern of having to build sidewalks twice. As long as there is a financial guarantee, he feels comfortable the sidewalks will be built. Attorney Jodoin stated the most practical process for tracking is the letter of credit from a local bank as they usually follow the installation of infrastructure.

Commissioner Noonan concurred the 18-months will work with an extension request being an option.

Consensus Direction to Manager – Manager Taylor stated staff will bring forward the entire Subdivision Regulations with the recommendation of up to 18-months and research options on how the ADA Committee can be involved.

Parks & Recreation

Expedition League Baseball – Parks & Recreation Director Teegarden reported At the May 16, 2018 administrative meeting, the City Commission instructed city staff and members of American Legion Baseball to work with Mr. Wagner from the collegiate Expedition League to "review" combined schedules. Each team submitted proposed 2019 schedules for games and practices.

- L&C Expedition League: The Expedition League proposes to use KLF starting on May 24 through August 4, 2019, with a total of 32 home games. There would also be periodic practices.
- Helena American Legion: American Legion proposes to use KLF from April through August. They provided a schedule that includes three teams and multi-day regional tournaments. Approximately 100 home games would be played at the field. They would also require the field for practices.

Field Capacity:

In reviewing the combined schedules, several concerns are raised from a field maintenance perspective. In order to maintain safe and quality playing field conditions, there should be one field rest day per week during March, April and May and best efforts made to allow no less than one day every ten days in June, July and August. Past practices working with the Helena Brewers, the goal was to limit total (both leagues) home games to 90-100 per season. The proposed schedules do not allow for adequate field rest. The overlap of proposed schedules would result in more than 130 games being played. In addition, more games would be played in a shorter period of time, meaning the seasons would overlap more tightly; May through August, rather than June-September as with the Brewers.

An additional scheduling concern is the time of day that the Expedition League would allow American Legion teams to play. Most of the shared days in May and early June would require the youth teams to play their home games during school hours; American Legion would be required to be off the field by 3:30. Not only does this require kids to be out of school, it also limits spectator attendance and parent support. Volunteer parent involvement is critical to the American Legion operations.

In addition to comparing the combined schedules, City staff called references that were provided by Mr. Wagner in other communities that host the Expedition League and share a field with American Legion. In summary, the communities where "shared-use" was successful were in cities that had more

than one field or artificial turf. Multiple fields allowed both leagues to space out their practices, games and field rest. In cities that only had one field, it was difficult and there were strained relationships between the leagues. In general scheduling was an issue in every community.

On the positive side, some references said that the Expedition League does try to engage in the community with free youth baseball clinics and support of charitable organizations.

Community Benefit:

In addition to reviewing the amount of use the field can sustain, city staff also evaluates recommendations based on community benefits; economically, socially and opportunities for growing the city's recreation program.

With the Helena Brewer's leaving at the end of the 2018 season, American Legion Baseball has the opportunity to grow their program. They would be able to increase local youth participants, partner with local businesses for sponsorships and sign revenue as well as host larger and more regional tournaments.

Youth baseball in Helena struggles to find enough fields to play on. The Ryan Fields (L&C County) are geared towards younger league (Babe Ruth) and it is difficult to accommodate the field requirements for Legion level baseball at Ryan Fields. With only one adequate field in town, it is difficult for American Legion to expand their program when they must share the field with another league.

One of the main revenue generators for the Helena Brewers and other for-profit leagues is sign sponsorships from local businesses. The American Legion team in Bozeman generates approximately \$170,000 in revenue from sign sponsors. Bozeman does not have a minor league or college level league. American Legion believes there would be strong support from local businesses and are not concerned about the additional "rent costs" of the facility.

In the past American Legion has not been able to host Class AA or A regional tournaments. Kindrick Legion Field is well suited for hosting tournaments. There would be an economic impact on Helena from tournaments. Currently American Legion tournaments results in approximately 702 hotel stays per summer. Additional proposed tournaments would result in more than double (1,476) hotel room stays. The TBID estimates that the economic impact of an overnight stay in Helena equals \$300.

In addition to expanding tournaments, American Legion has a desire to enhance their partnership with Babe Ruth Baseball and other sports organizations by hosting championship games at the field, conducting youth sports camps, etc.

City staff would like to explore the potential for hosting non-baseball special events at the facility such as music festivals or adult recreation league to name a few. The facility could be used for than baseball, providing a larger benefit and asset to the broader Helena community by providing additional recreational opportunities.

In the event the Helena had more than one baseball field and stadium, city staff would welcome the opportunity to work with the Expedition League. However at this time, city staff proposes a two year delay in negotiating with a new league in an effort to allow Legion baseball to expand their program and evaluate the potential community benefits of different recreational uses of the facility.

Legion baseball has the opportunity to grow their program and continue to foster youth baseball in Helena. A disadvantage is there may not be interest in the future by other leagues.

Staff is asking for policy direction from the commission.

Mayor Collins noted the commission did give direction to allow the two years for Legion Baseball to grow their program. However, the commission received a letter from the Expedition League after the July 25th administrative meeting and in order to form a fair decision, he asked that this be put back on the agenda.

Commissioner Haladay asked Director Teegarden, as he understands it today, the question is negotiating a potential lease with either Legion Baseball or the Expedition League and the contract would ultimately come before the commission. Director Teegarden concurred that staff is asking for policy direction from the commission not to enter into an agreement with the Expedition League at this time and see what the community benefits are for allow Legion to grow their program. Commissioner Haladay asked how the charges will be included in the lease agreement. The direction at the July 25th meeting was staff would also put out an RFP to other teams to see what interest there may be. Commissioner Haladay asked if the lease agreement will be the same rental amount as what the Brewers were paying or some type of discount. Director Teegarden stated that will be a policy decision; more use by the Legion program would cost them additional funding. If negotiating with the Expedition League, the lease the Brewers used would be a good starting point. She also noted all expenses are not covered through the lease agreements.

Mayor Collins noted the commission has received a lot of email and letters regarding this issue. He asked those wanting to address the commission to be respectful of time and each other. Due to the number of people wanting to speak, Mayor Collins stated he will allocate 30-minutes for those in support of allowing the Legion Program the two years and 30-minutes for those in support of bringing in the Expedition League.

The following persons spoke in support of the American Legion Program:– Greg Thornquist, General Manager of American Legion Baseball; Miles Wacker; Montana Adult Baseball League; Jay Scott, Historian and radio announcer; Amy Sassano, parent; John Burnett, Head Coach of Helena Senators; Stephanie Thennis , parent and General Manager of Brewers (1998-?); Nick Miller; Larry Sickerson, parent; and Rick Ahmann; parent;

The following persons spoke in support of the Expedition League: Steve Wagner, Expedition League; Robert Laferdy; Dave Johnson; Ed Maddox; Jerry Sorenson; Lucy Richards; Phil Johnson; Marlene Hughes; Judy Erickson; Debora Wambach; and Kim Ranger.

Commission Discussion – Commissioner O’Loughlin asked Mr. Thornquist what was the relationship between the Brewers and American Legion and does he believe American Legion could work with the Expedition League. Mr. Thornquist stated the issue is field time and American Legion had to present the Brewers their practice schedule. In addition, the Brewers had their own groundskeeper who was passionate about the condition of the field and kept the legion players off the field. Mr. Thornquist stated they recognized the 3rd team would not get field time at Kindrick and had to play at the Ryan Fields and travel to other communities. The financial burden on parents to travel is another issue. Commissioner O’Loughlin asked when the schedule for 2019 is set. Mr. Thornquist deferred the question to Coach Burnett

Mayor Collins asked if there is an active effort to coordinate schedules between the Legion and the Expedition League. Mr. Thornquist stated the two schedules were laid on top of each other to determine any scheduling conflict. He noted the risk to the field is also an issue.

Mayor Collins clarified how the two schedules were compared and asked if there were no discussions between the two parties; no sit down. Mr. Thornquist referred the question to Coach Burnett.

Coach Burnett stated the Legion games will be set in January 2019 and noted the Expedition League schedules their games prior to January.

Commissioner O’Loughlin asked Mr. Wagner, by thinking through the financial feasibility, what the attendance number would be that would make the Expedition League a financial viability. Mr. Wagner noted the attendance of 400-450 is the break-even point. He also noted the Expedition League is flexible on when scheduling and would wait until after the Legion program sets their schedule; he does not have a drop dead date on when the schedule is set.

Mayor Collins asked when the schedules were put together, why they weren’t discussed. Director Teegarden noted a conference call with Mr. Wagner and representatives from Legion was held to discuss scheduling, staff’s recommendation; field capacity and rest days. This conversation was held in mid-July.

Commissioner Noonan stated it is painful to hear the tension with Helena’s baseball community. He believes the American Legion team has earned the opportunity to grow and then discuss what other use is feasible. The Helena youth baseball community are good stewards of the facilities, Ryan Fields and Kindrick Field. He would support the two year hiatus and to see what Legion Baseball can accomplish.

Mayor Collins stated he does not believe active efforts were made to alleviate the scheduling problems; he would like to see everyone go back to drawing board and actively discuss them.

Commissioner O’Loughlin noted she has reviewed the July 25th administrative meeting summary, read all public comments and was part of the lengthy discussion the Parks Board had on this topic. She believes the conversations on scheduling should continue and not wait for two full years to begin negotiating with another team. She agrees with Commissioner Noonan to give the American Legion baseball time to develop their program, under conditions they have not had. Commissioner O’Loughlin stated she supports holding off brining in another team; however, she too has been disappointed with the communications and conversations between the city, Legion baseball and the Expedition League. The city can consider another team in the future beyond the 2019 season.

Commissioner Farris-Olsen noted the lack of communication is an issue and there is room to work on a schedule that would work for everyone. Go back and try to work a schedule that would work for both teams.

Commissioner Haladay asked if the direction is to send it back for further coordination of schedules, what the timeframe we are looking at is. Director Teegarden stated if there is commission

direction, staff will work with American Legion and the Expedition League on the scheduling. She noted beyond the concerns with scheduling there are other concerns including sponsorship funding and the business arrangement for both teams. Commissioner Haladay asked if staff would recommend coming back in a in a month or two weeks with an update. Director Teegarden stated if it is commission direction, she will put together a meeting for next week with the representatives from Legion and the Expedition League.

Mayor Collins stated he is not trying to make this difficult; however, if possible he would like to see the scheduling problems alleviated. Mr. Wagner stated he is can meet anytime; immediately if possible. Director Teegarden stated there have been several meetings and there has been communications. She noted that scheduling and field capacity are just two issues; there are others. Helena has only has one field.

Manager Taylor stated if it is the commission direction to give the American Legion baseball program two years and begin to solicit a wider proposal, both expedition league and minor league teams before the two years and come back in the spring of 2019 with a proposal. This is a change from previous direction.

Commissioner Haladay stated he will reluctantly support going forward with giving the American Legion baseball program two years to grow their program. He then stated Kindrick Field is a community benefit with scarce resources, if you do not pay city taxes, we cannot build out and support two programs. County taxes do not allow the city to support two programs. Commissioner Haladay stated he is comfortable with the original decision that includes preparing an RFP prior to the two years to recruit another minor league team or an expedition team. Staff will negotiate a contract with American Legion that includes charges to cover expense; the city cannot supplement the Legion program.

There was commission consensus that staff will proceed with a two year use agreement with American Legion Baseball and move forward with reaching out to other expedition and minor league teams prior to the two years.

Beattie Street Trailhead - Parks & Recreation Director Teegarden reported users of vibrant and sustainable trails systems expect certain services such as; safe places to park or access the trails, accurate trail information, trash receptacles, sanitation, etc. The city has been planning and making parking improvements at various trailheads throughout the open land system as trail use continues to increase. In an effort to improve and mitigate parking issues, the city proposes to remove parking from the Beattie Street right-of-way onto parkland where parking and trail use can be better managed.

On May 2, 2018 the city commission gave consensus direction to city staff to move forward with a final design and development/funding strategy for the revised recommended Alternative #1 for improved parking at the end of Beattie Street. Following public comment at the May 16 administrative meeting, the city commission requested completion of a traffic and speed study for Beattie Street and directed staff to incorporate the findings into the alternative recommendation.

The city engineering department hired Abelin Traffic Studies (ATS) who conducted a speed and traffic study between Broadway Street and the south end of Beattie Street to determine if the posted speed limit is appropriate for the existing road conditions or if traffic calming measures are warranted on Beattie Street. The observed traffic data indicated that the vehicle speeds along Beattie Street are fairly consistent. There is little evidence that drivers on Beattie Street are exceeding the posted 25 MPH speed limit. The vast majority of drivers (over 99%) are traveling at less than 30 PHH and the average driver is traveling at 19 MPH.

After completion of the traffic study, city staff summarized the information and made it available on the city webpage. A public meeting was held on July 31 to discuss the traffic study, the City's traffic calming program/policy and the revised recommended Alternative #1. City staff also hosted an informational booth at Alive@Five, the following evening in an additional effort to inform citizens of the proposal. At the July 31 public meeting, concerns were raised about when the traffic and speed study was conducted over a holiday weekend (Memorial Day) and was not a fair indication of actual speed and traffic. As a result, city staff had ATS conduct a follow-up traffic study August 9-13th. The results from the second study indicated the 85th percentile speed on Beattie Street is 24.7 MPH and is 0.5 MPH higher than the previous speed study.

There continues to be public comment both in support and against the revised recommendation.

Based on the 2018 traffic studies and additional public comment, city staff maintains a recommendation for the revised Alternative #1 (presented on May 2, 2018). This revised alternative is a reconfiguration of Alternative 1, which reduces parking capacity by eliminating parking spaces on the

lower or easternmost tier of the parking area proposed for construction under the recommended alternative. Items remaining consistent between Alternative 1 and the recommended revised alternative include the geographic position, one way traffic flow, and angled parking. All parking spaces, a restroom facility, kiosk, pet station, and picnic tables would be located on the upper or westernmost tier of the parking area presented within recommended alternative.

Director Teegarden asked for commission direction to move forward in developing final design and a development strategy for city staff's recommended alternative.

Commissioner Haladay asked for clarification that the proposed design includes 20 total parking spaces; 18 spaces plus two ADA spaces. Engineer Leland concurred.

Mayor Collins noted the commission has received a lot of email and letters regarding this issue. He asked those wanting to address the commission to be respectful of time and each other. Due to the number of people wanting to speak, Mayor Collins stated he will allocate 20-minutes for those in support of moving forward with staff's recommendation of Alternate One and those against moving forward.

The following persons addressed the commission in support of Alternative One as recommended by city staff: Mary Hollow; PPLT; Eric Grove; Dan Berry; Eric Sivers; Lori Smith; Morgan Smith; and Angie Grove;

The following persons addressed the commission in opposition of Alternative One as recommended by city staff: Attorney Abigail St. Lawrence; Lynne Boone; Cheri Thorton; Nick Sovnor; and Susan Leonard.

Commissioner Noonan noted he too read all of the public comment received and agrees traffic calming should be considered for Beattie; review the process for public notification on how this issue was handled; renew and treat access to the open spaces/trailheads. Commissioner Noonan then commented that hearing the negative comments regarding bikers and the controversy this issue has generated is not good for the community. He also addressed the web site that was been developed in opposition and how the information on the web page is being used is not the Helena community he knows. Commissioner Noonan stated the determining factor of him supporting moving forward with Alternate One is the trailhead is not accessible. Beattie Street should be accessible and be able to be used by the disabled community.

Commissioner O'Loughlin stated she too read all of the comments received and going back to the 2013 commission meeting minutes and has done her research. Commissioner O'Loughlin stated there has been significant public feedback from December 2017 and she reviewed the number of meetings held regarding this issue. A lot of what the commission sees is in reaction to the comments received from the citizens of Helena. This is a revised option from the original proposal and there is real justifiable reasons to build an accessible parking lot. Traffic calming should continue to be discussed and she would ask staff to look at traffic calming. Commissioner O'Loughlin stated she is comfortable moving forward.

Commissioner Haladay stated he first heard about the proposal in December 2017 and the commission asked for an update and took a step back and recognized this is not a quasi-judicial determination; many lost site on what we are talking about. The commission asked to have additional public meetings and those meetings were held and included robust public comments regarding this issue. The public process on this proposal is the most he has heard on any one project. He does take personal umbrage that by the commission making a decision they are carrying out some conspiracy; those comments are wrong and an attack on the commission's intention. There has been a good public process and he is comfortable moving forward with Alternative One. Commissioner Haladay asked staff to look at bulb outs adjacent to Clinton Park and finishing out sidewalks on Beattie Street. Traffic study was done for the neighborhood and just because the numbers don't meet a standard; we have to recognize it is a neighborhood.

Mayor Collins re-echoed Commissioner Haladay's comments. Traffic calming and sidewalks should be included in the engineering design.

There was commission consensus to move forward with designing Alternate One, bulb-outs adjacent to Clinton Park and sidewalk improvements.

Commissioner Noonan asked staff to look at alternatives that would deal with the run-off from Beattie Street.

Commissioner O'Loughlin asked that the commission have another discussion on Cruse Avenue. Manager Taylor stated staff is prepared to bring this issue back for further discussion.

Mayor Collins stated the rest of the agenda, including the Sidewalk Projects-FY19 will be tabled until the next administrative meeting.

With no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 8:10 p.m.