

**SUMMARY OF ADMINISTRATIVE MEETING**  
**December 17, 2014 – 4:00 p.m.**  
**Room 326, City-County Building**

**1. Call to order, introductions, opening comments** – Mayor Smith called the meeting to order. Commissioners Ellison, Elsaesser, Haladay and Haque-Hausrath were present. Staff present was: City Manager Alles; City Attorney Thomas Jodoin; Police Chief Troy McGee; Community Development Director Sharon Haugen; Public Works Director Randall Camp; Assistant Public Works Director Phil Hauck; City Engineer Ryan Leland; Solid Waste Superintendent Pete Anderson; Street Superintendent Ben Sautter; Community Facilities Director Gery Carpenter; Fire Chief Sean Logan; Administrative Services Director Tim Magee; Code Enforcement Coordinator Greta Dige; HCC Coordinator Judy Garrity and City Clerk Debbie Havens.

Others in attendance included: HCC Representatives John Forbes, IR Reporter Al Knauber, Melinda Barnes, Bike Walk Montana, George McCauley, ADA Committee, John Hilton, Helena Recycling, Doug Sparrow, Tri-County Sanitation, Dave Leveratt, Full Circle Recycling, Eric Kohring, ADA Committee and Terry Ray.

**2. November 19, 2014 Administrative Meeting Summary** – The November 19, 2014 administrative meeting summary was approved as submitted.

**3. Commission comments, questions** – Commissioner Elsaesser asked when the summary of the meeting between city staff and the building community would be available to the commission. Manager Alles stated he will circulate it to the commission.

Upcoming appointments:

Mayor Smith recommended the appointments listed below.

Board of Adjustment	Anna Lindstrand as the alternate member on the Board of Adjustment. Unexpired term will begin upon appointment and expire October 1, 2015.
Civic Center Board	Bonnie Lorang and Tim Andridge to the Civic Center Board. Unexpired terms will begin upon appointment and expire March 1, 2015.
Tenmile/S. Helena Forest Restoration	Angela Grove, representing local recreational user Collaborative Committee organizations. Term will begin upon appointment.

**4. City Manager's Report** – City Manager Alles reported on the following items:

**Tenmile/South Helena Forest Restoration Committee** – the original proposal was to hire a full time employee, which would have been paid by the Forest Service; however, the current proposal is the employee will be a contract employee. This process worked very well with the first committee. An RFQ will be prepared, with the assistance of the committee members.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked how the recommendations from the original committee will come forward. Manager Alles stated the new committee is basing their conversations around the original report. The Forest Service has expanded their scope of services and will also apply some of the same concepts and ideas from the original report. Commissioner Elsaesser asked if the expertise brought forward by Dr. Finney will be used and concept of landscape treatment. Manager Alles stated yes.

Mayor Smith stated he is comfortable with a facilitator rather than hiring a FTE.

**Legislative Shuttle Update** - Manager Alles referred the commission to the MOU between the Department of Administration and the City of Helena to provide shuttle services during the 2015 legislature. The state has verbally offered a firm amount of \$25,000 to \$35,000. Manager Alles recommended the final costs will be split three ways. The state will provide the necessary public information for the shuttle bus. There is also an effort to raise funds from private lobbyist groups.

Commissioner Ellison asked if the city's contribution will be the driver's time and will any cash funds be allocated toward the city's portion. Manager Alles stated the city's maximum contribution will be \$25,000, which would include providing the bus and the driver; there will be no cash outlay for the shuttle.

Commissioner Ellison commented this is a good arrangement and he is fully supportive of moving forward with the pilot project.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath asked if the city is positive the numbers from the shuttle will count toward the ridership for the 5311 grant application. Manager Alles stated yes and Public Works Director Camp confirmed.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath asked if the shuttle bus would have the new brand on the bus. Manager Alles stated not at this time; there have been discussions with the sponsors.

**Consideration of city property for jail location** – Manager Alles referred the commission to a letter he received from Lewis & Clark County Administrator Eric Bryson regarding a possible location for a new County jail. Manager Alles stated he wants to be cautious to say yes at this time; staff is studying geotechnical aspects of the site for potential expansion of our wastewater treatment plant. However, he would not want to pull this property off the table at this time.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked if this piece of property is higher than the water table. Manager Alles stated yes and explained the different levels of groundwater in the area. The city may need to purchase additional property if the above testing is allowed. Commissioner Elsaesser stated he appreciates anything staff can do to address nutrient treatment.

Mayor Smith asked if the Human Society had issues with this piece of property. Manager Alles stated the issue the Human Society had was they could not afford the extension of water/wastewater to the property.

Chief McGee reported the other properties being considered for the jail is at the intersection of Cedar/Airport Road; Sanders Street west of the interstate; and a piece of property located between the wastewater treatment plant and the city owned property.

Manager Alles stated the city's property is probably the top priority due to location and the city owning it. The city is willing to work with the county but he wants to explore our options.

Mayor Smith stated the city needs to formally respond to Mr. Bryson and demure on the topic until staff has had the opportunity to explore our options. Manager Alles stated he will prepare a response to the county.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked for a timeframe when staff will have the research completed. Public Works Director Camp stated spring of 2015; Morrison Maierle has been retained to do the work.

Commissioner Ellison asked Manager Alles to verbalize what his response to county will be. Manager Alles stated he would let the county know that the offer is not off the table; however the city has further work to do to keep the wastewater rates down at a later date.

Commissioner Ellison and Mayor Smith stated they are comfortable with the response.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath asked if the two uses could be potentially coordinated for the same site. Manager Alles stated yes.

There was consensus to have Manager Alles respond as indicated above.

Manager Alles reported the Tenmile Water Treatment Plant is up and running.

## **5. Department Discussions**

### **Public Works**

#### **Transfer Station – Discussion on Landfill Closure/Issues Regarding Transfer Station**

**Closure** - Manager Alles gave an overview of recent changes to hours of operation at the landfill and how this could affect the transfer station operations. Public Works Director Randall Camp reported the county began closing the Scratch Gravel landfill on December 6th and continuing until April. The landfill will be short staffed due to personnel issues and cannot currently operate 7 days a week. Two days of landfill closure necessitates the discussion of closing the Transfer Station for one day due to permit and operational constraints. The underlying conflict in the efficiency study is the recommendation that the landfill closes on the weekends (their lowest volume days) and that the transfer station closes on Wednesday and Thursday (our lowest traffic but higher volumes days). In light of these conflicting recommendations, the county circumstances, and trying to come to a workable response, city staff proposed closing on Sundays starting the 7th of December for the same period as the County as a pilot program only for winter hours of operation.

Director Camp reviewed the following information from the December 12<sup>th</sup>, 2014 memo to City Manager Alles:

#### **DEQ Operating Permit**

- By permit, the City of Helena Transfer Station is approved to stockpile waste in the waste pit for only one day.

- DEQ denied staff request to stockpile waste in the pit for two days.
- DEQ denial requires storage of waste in transfer trailers onsite in order to accommodate landfill closure.
- DEQ has requested a vehicle usage count and an inbound waste tonnage volume for both Saturday & Sunday and that this Transfer Station information be sent to them first thing each Monday morning to insure we are operating within our permit language.

#### **Transfer Trailer Storage**

The Transfer Station can only remain open on Saturdays and Sundays by dollying the Transfer Trailers and storing the loaded trailers at the Transfer Station until they can be hauled first thing Monday morning.

- **Fire** -There is significant risk in this option from the possibility of having a fire in the stored trailer. This has happened before at the Transfer Station and in our collection vehicles due to people disposing of hot coals from fireplaces/woodstoves or chemical reactions in their garbage. A transfer trailer was destroyed by the fire. Trailers must be decoupled from transfer truck to prevent loss of the truck in the event of a fire in the trailer.
- **Freeze** -There is a risk that the garbage could freeze in the trailers and therefore could not be unloaded on Monday or until thawed out. Freeze up in all three trailers could lead to unplanned Transfer Station closure until such time as they thaw and are available for transferring waste to landfill. This risk could disrupt all solid waste activities. The first weekend of landfill closure resulted in the freeze up of one trailer when the weather was fairly mild.
- **Non-compliance** – The City would be in non-compliance with our operating permit if one day tonnage exceeds our capacity of 3 trailers (72 tons) in a single day of operation without the ability to haul. The cumulative average tonnage generated on Saturdays and Sundays is 71 tons. It is highly likely that there will be weekends that will exceed our 72 ton storage capacity, thereby resulting in non-compliance.
- **Safety** - De-coupling the trailers from the chassis can be problematic in the winter due to temperature and it is a safety issue that we usually try to avoid if at all possible. Trailers must be decoupled from transfer truck to prevent loss of the truck in the event of a fire in the trailer.

#### **Customers vs. Tonnage – Winter Closure**

**(Graphs of winter vs. summer were included in the Administrative Meeting packet for reference)**

- During the winter, Sunday tonnage is by far the lowest of any day of the week. An average of approximately 20 tons of waste is generated versus approximately 63 tons in the summer.
- Traffic displaced by a Sunday closure could easily be absorbed by Saturday traffic and traffic throughout the week without creating significantly increased traffic conflict or undue burden on the Transfer Station operation.
- Traffic on Sunday consists primarily of small quantity customers.
- Approximately 70% of the traffic on Sunday consists of Scratch Gravel Residents; approximately 23% of the traffic on Sunday consists of City Residents. The remaining 7% are cash customers.
- Weekday tonnage generation can be 5 to 6 times higher on average than Sunday tonnage due to the waste generated in commercial, residential curbside, and self-haul operations.

#### **Staffing**

- Closing on a weekend day would allow Transfer Station Staff to have a weekend day off with their families.
- Staffing savings will be primarily on the County side until consolidation of the two entities allows City staff to perform functions at the landfill, thereby leading to across the board better utilization of staff.

#### **Options for Winter Operations**

##### **1. Continue 7 day per week with the Landfill closed weekends.**

- Allow the landfill to close on weekends during winter, either Saturday or Sunday or both days, unless transfer station makes an appointment for the landfill weekend during the business week (Recent Commissioner Elsaesser handout).
- Pursue the possibility with the State DEQ to modify the operating permit to extend storage in the pit.
- Cross-train Transfer Station operators to handle landfill operations on weekends.
- Or, Purchase additional transfer trailers.

**Continue 7 day per week with the Landfill closed 1 day per week.**

- Request County to remain open on Saturdays.
- Cross-train Transfer Station operators to handle landfill operations on Saturday if needed.

**Close the Transfer Station on a weekend day with landfill closed on weekend.**

- Sunday is the lowest volume weekend day and the lowest tonnage day during the winter months.
- **Close the Transfer Station on a weekday**
- Establish trial winter hours at the transfer station that may include closing one day a week (Monday for example) and limiting hours on other days (10 a.m. to 4:45 p.m., two hours less, on Sundays for example). (Recent Commissioner Elsaesser handout).
- Request the County to remain open on Saturdays and possibly Sunday to coincide with whatever day of our closing during the week.

Manager Alles referred the commission to the transfer station activity – winter and summer daily averages – November 2013 through October 2014. Sunday has more permit holders than weekdays; however, the tonnage is less. Comparing graphs in the report anticipates the city doing direct haul to the landfill.

He further explained why Sunday was chosen; even if another day is chosen to close the scale the transfer station would still need to be open due to residential and commercial solid waste routes.

Commissioner Elsaesser asked how closing Sunday could resolve the issue of storing garbage in the trailers from Saturday. Manager Alles stated the Sunday closure would have less tonnage, based on our averages, stored and still meet the permit through DEQ.

Commissioner Elsaesser stated he is concerned with limiting access to the residents who pay for the transfer station.

Solid Waste Superintendent Pete Anderson stated if the transfer station were closed on Sunday, the residential collection on Sunday would be moved to Monday. Of the 282 trips to the transfer station, 200 were Scratch Gravel permits and 82 were city permits.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated she is in favor of looking at eliminating Saturday and Sunday collection routes; however, there needs to be some work done before closing the transfer station on Sunday. The curb-side recycling would need to be up and running prior to any closure. As indicated in the study, she would support the implementation of a minimum charge at the transfer station. Manager Alles stated staff will look at a minimum charge and possibly increase it. Staff struggled in choosing Sunday as the day to close; however the real difference is approximately 100 additional Helena residents use the transfer station on Sunday and approximately 300 on other days of the week.

Commissioner Ellison asked City Manager Alles to quantify the cost savings if the transfer station is closed on Sunday. Manager Alles stated the real savings is going to require that we staff appropriately. Manager Alles stated he is not prepared to lay off employees for the balance of the winter. Long term, when some of the other recommendations from the study are implemented, there will be staff efficiencies. The savings currently being seen is through the tipping fee when garbage is delivered to the landfill.

Commissioner Ellison asked if no residential collection is done on Sunday, what the cost savings would be. Superintendent Anderson stated the Sunday route would have to be picked up on Monday; therefore, there would be no cost savings.

Commissioner Elsaesser stated he continues to have additional concerns there will not be any viable or actual savings and not having the transfer station open to the citizens on the week-end. He does not agree with the rationale provided for the recommendation.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath stated in order to realize a true savings the transfer station would need to close one day a week year round. She would propose after the other changes are implemented, staff would identify one day a week. A decision should be made within the next six months to one year.

Manager Alles stated staff's biggest concern is the storage of the garbage. He again explained if the garbage is stored in the trailers and they freeze, the transfer station would have to close. Superintendent Anderson stated the three trailers have the capacity to store up to 70 tons of waste; however, last week one froze up and it took up to 2 ½ hours to thaw in order to dump it at the landfill. If this were to happen to all three trailers, the transfer station would have to close.

Commissioner Haque-Hausrath asked if the residential/commercial pick-up on week-ends could be eliminated and if so, how much tonnage would that be. Superintendent Anderson stated there are 30 to 40 tons collected on Sunday and 50 to 80 tons on Saturday. The Sunday residential pick-up could be moved; however, the Saturday commercial routes could not.

Manager Alles stated the recommendation will be to move the Sunday residential pick-up to another day. Commissioner Elsaesser asked why the city doesn't do a tonnage trade with the private hauler for the day(s) the county is closed, as the hauler has offered for some time and is open on weekends. Manager Alles stated this is a possibility.

Public Comment – Mayor Smith asked for public comment, none was received.

Mayor Smith stated he is comfortable with staff's recommendation to close the transfer station on Sunday. Commissioner Ellison asked if it is staff's recommendation to close the transfer station on Sunday; if it is, he too would support closing the transfer station on Sunday. Manager Alles noted staff has discussed closing the transfer station one or two days a week for several years and with the county closing the landfill on the weekends, it makes sense.

Commissioner Elsaesser again stated he disagrees that the recommendation makes no sense as the residents pay for the transfer station to remain open. He is also concerned with doing a pilot project on a weekend day different from days recommended in the report; report shows a study of use based on implementation of consolidated routes and direct haul by city residential, city commercial and Scratch Gravel permits with Tri-County.

Commissioner Haladay stated at this time, there is no reason to close on Sunday; the point was to recognize some level savings and better serve the assessed parties. If all we are going to do is move the service and charge for a less convenient service, it doesn't make sense. If we move forward with a pilot project, staff needs to look at how to provide a better expanded service and show the most cost effective way to accomplish it.

**Consensus Direction to the Manager: Do not close the landfill any day of the week at this time. Staff will work on a contingency plan in case the trailers freeze up or explore other options or days for partial closure.**

#### **Curbside Recycling Request for Proposals (RFP)**

Manager Alles presented the following draft RFP language to the Commission for curbside recycling services. Staff comments are provided in red.

The City of Helena is requesting qualifications from firms capable of providing curbside recycling services. Curbside services will involve conducting **1. weekly, 2. bi-weekly, or 3. monthly** curbside collection of various commodities as detailed below. It is anticipated that this program will be **1. an optional service, 2. a subscription based service**. Proposals must be submitted no later than 5:00 p.m. local time on **Wednesday, January 21, 2015** at the office of the Clerk of City Commission, Room 322, City-County Building, 316 N. Park Avenue, Helena, MT 59623. Proposals are to be submitted in a sealed envelope marked on the outside "Curbside Recycling Services".

#### Scope of Services:

1. Proposal will need to include the cost per resident to provide **weekly, bi-weekly, or monthly** curbside collection for both the City of Helena,
2. Proposal will need to include the type of container provided (**automated roll-out 90-gallon containers for example**), the **color (other than black)**, and the cost per container. Proposal should show an example of the type of container and the stamp designations included on the containers (**recycling stamp, company name, etc.**).
3. Proposal will need to include the number of containers needed per resident based on the proposal (**Co-mingled or separated**),
4. Proposal will need to include the follow types of commodities that would be collected curbside. The commodities that will be collected curbside will include: **Aluminum cans, glass, steel cans, newsprint, magazines, corrugated cardboard, paperboard, white office paper, catalogs, mail, phone books, paper bags, plastics (separated), plastics (1-7), grass, green waste, e-waste, etc.**,
5. Proposal will need to describe the type of vehicles proposed to be used to service curbside collection (**The City of Helena will require/prefer the use of either hybrid, battery, CNG (Compressed Natural Gas), bio-diesel, or hydrogen vehicles for this program**),

6. Proposal will need to provide a plan that explains how and where collected recyclable will be processed. All materials collected will be required to be recycled. Collected material **will/will not** be allowed to be taken to the Transfer Station. **No material will be landfilled.**
7. Proposal will need to state the days and hours of operation for the curbside recycling program. Preferred schedule would be Monday-Friday, 8 a.m. – 5 p.m. Alley collection will be discouraged.
8. Proposal needs to include a communication and marketing plan for the curbside recycling program.
9. Proposal will require that the contractor supply the City of Helena a quantified report of each commodity collected and processed on a monthly basis.

It is the City's intention that the **1.) contractor will be responsible to bill residents for the curbside service and collect directly from residents, 2). City will bill only the residents that utilize the curbside collection program and pay contractor, 3. City will bill all residents for the curbside collection program and pay the contractor based on the actual utilization of the service, 4. Contractor will provide service in exchange for the value of commodities.** It is the City's intention to enter into a contract with **1 year increments not to exceed 5 years.** Proposal will require that the contractor supply a detailed customer list to include participant name and address on a monthly basis.

Ten (10) copies of the proposals and all supporting materials suitable for evaluation shall be submitted. Legibility, clarity and completeness are essential. Proposals should provide assurance that the firm has the professional capability to satisfactorily complete all the tasks as described in the previous sections.

The proposals shall contain the following:

1. The firm's legal name, address and telephone number;
2. The principal of the firm to be assigned to the project;
3. The experience and qualifications of the individuals assigned to the team;
4. A description of the firm's prior experience (including entity, and name of local official knowledgeable of the firm's performance) with any similar projects.
5. A description of any recent and/or current work for the City of Helena;
6. The proposed work plan and schedule for activities to be performed;
7. A description of the firm's current workload and how it would be coordinated with the services provided as well as the firm's anticipated availability during the term of the contract;
8. Anticipated use of other firms as subcontractors.

The proposals will be evaluated based on the following criteria:

- \* The qualifications of professional personnel to be assigned to the project;
- \* The capability to meet time and project budget requirements;
- \* Present and projected workloads;
- \* Related experience on similar projects;
- \* Recent and current work for the City of Helena, or a similar entity; and
- \* Overall quality of the proposal.

The City may personally interview finalists. If interviews are deemed necessary, members of the team designated in the proposal will make the presentations.

Final selection will be based on all previously identified data. When the City has approved the ranking, contract negotiations will commence with the highest-ranked company. If an appropriate agreement cannot be reached with the highest-ranked firm, the second-ranked firm will be approached, and so on. Selected firm will be required to sign a City of Helena template contract and meet all requirements of the contract. The City reserves the right to reject any or all proposals, to waive any irregularities in the proposals, and to accept the proposal that best benefits the City.

All proposals become the property of the selection committee. The selection committee reserves the right to reject any or all proposals and to readvertise this RFP. The City will not be held accountable for costs associated with preparing proposals in response to the RFP.

Questions for the City of Helena should be directed to Randall Camp, Director of Public Works, City of Helena, 316 North Park, Helena, Montana, 59623.

The City reserves the right to negotiate an agreement based on fair and reasonable compensation for the scope of work and services proposed as well as the right to reject any and all responses deemed unqualified, unsatisfactory or inappropriate.

The commission reviewed the above RFP in depth, made amendments and directed staff to bring back the amended RFP to an administrative meeting for final review. Main points discussed included the following:

- Bi-weekly service with bins distinct from trash bins
- Bins owned by city in event of service change
- RFP to include processing options, potentially at transfer station as outlined in Implementation Item Recycling 6 (R6 Final, SWS Efficiency Study HLN/L&C Blue Ridge Services Fall 2014)
- Collection to include common metals and fibers generated by households; cardboard, tin and aluminum, plastics 1-7, office/newspaper/magazines
- Curbside collection not to include glass
- Program to be optional for assessed residents, paid for by residential hauling utility
- Single bin recycling/clean single stream recycling
- Fuel source of vehicles not to be specified in RFP at this time
- Methodology for accounting for cost of service based on use of service by residents need to be established
- The recycling services will be paid for by all city residents through the residential solid waste assessment, similar to the current trash collection.

**Public Comment –**

Dave Leveratt, Full Circle Recycling, recommended the commission be specific on what commodities you want to accept before making the decision on hauling. He also recommended the commission be very specific with the RFP language, specifically the processing arrangement.

John Hilton, Helena Recycling, addressed the commission regarding his business of providing separated curb side recycling for the past six years; he recommended the city not accept glass and that green waste and e-waste not be part of the curb side program. Mr. Hilton also recommended that a bi-weekly service would be sufficient and that the drop off locations should be kept.

John Forbes and George McCauley also addressed the commission regarding the proposal for curb side recycling.

There was further commission discussion on the logistics of the program to include the size of the bins, how many bins per household, who purchases the bins, what commodities will and will not be accepted; keep the current drop-off sites or not, accept glass or not, who will bail the commodities and at what location.

**Consensus Direction to City Manager - Staff will prepare an amended Request for Proposals, to include the amendments that received commission consensus.**

**Due to the meeting adjourning at 6:00 p.m., the remainder of the agenda was not discussed.**

**6. Committee discussions**

- a) Audit Committee, City-County Board of Health, Civic Center Board, L&C County Mental Health Advisory Committee, Montana League of Cities & Towns – No report given.
- b) Audit Committee, Board of Adjustment, Helena Chamber of Commerce Liaison, Information Technology Committee, Transportation Coordinating Committee — No report given.
- c) Intergovernmental Transit Committee, Non-Motorized Travel Advisory Board, Transportation Coordinating Committee – No report given.
- d) ADA Compliance Committee, Business Improvement District/Helena Parking Commission, City-County Parks Board, Montana Business Assistance Connection – No report given.
- e) Audit Committee, City-County Administration Building (CCAB), Public Art Committee – No report given.
- f) Helena Citizens Council – No report given.

**7. Review of agenda for December 22, 2014 City Commission meeting – No discussion held.**

8. **Public Comment** – Lloyd Sparks with MILP addressed the commission regarding the importance of addressing the sidewalk snow removal ordinance. He applauded the commission for addressing recycling.
9. **Commission discussion and direction to the City Manager** – No discussion held.
10. **Adjourn** – Meeting adjourned at 6:10 p.m.